

1 Robert A. Sacks (SBN 150146)
sacksr@sullcrom.com
2 Rory P. Culver (SBN 271868)
culverr@sullcrom.com
3 SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
1888 Century Park East, Suite 2100
4 Los Angeles, California 90067
Tel.: (310) 712-6600
5 Fax: (310) 712-8800

6 Laura Kabler Oswell (SBN 241281)
oswelll@sullcrom.com
7 SULLIVAN & CROMWELL LLP
1870 Embarcadero Road
8 Palo Alto, California 94303
Tel.: (650) 461-5600
9 Fax: (650) 461-5700

10 Attorneys for Intervenor Thomson
Consumer Electronics, Inc.
11
12

13 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**
14 **NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**
15 **SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

16 IN RE: CATHODE RAY TUBE (CRT)) Case No. 07-5944-SC
17 ANTITRUST LITIGATION)
18) MDL No. 1917

19 This Document Relates to:)

20 *Electrograph Systems, Inc., et al. v. Hitachi,*)
Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-01656;

21 *Alfred H. Siegel, as Trustee of the Circuit*)
City Stores, Inc. Liquidating Trust v. Hitachi,)
Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-05502;

22 *Best Buy Co., Inc., et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et*)
al., No. 11-cv-05513;

23 *Target Corp, et al. v. Chunghwa Picture*)
Tubes, Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-05514;

24 *Office Depot, Inc. v. Hitachi Ltd., et al.*, No.)
11-cv-06276;

25) **[PROPOSED] REPORT AND**
26 **RECOMMENDATION GRANTING**
27 **MOTION OF THOMSON CONSUMER**
28 **ELECTRONICS, INC. TO INTERVENE**

29 Date: May 1, 2013

30 Time: 9:30 a.m.

31 JAMS: Two Embarcadero Center, Suite 1500

32 Judge: Hon. Samuel Conti

33 Special Master: Hon. Charles A. Legge (Ret.)

34) **[MOTION TO INTERVENE AND**
35 **DECLARATION OF LAURA KABLER**
36 **OSWELL IN SUPPORT OF MOTION TO**
37 **INTERVENE FILED CONCURRENTLY**
38 **HEREWITH]**

1 *CompuCom Systems, Inc. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et*)
2 *al., No. 11-cv-06396;*)
3 *Costco Wholesale Corporation v. Hitachi,*)
4 *Ltd., et al., No. 11-cv-06397;*)
5 *P.C. Richard & Son Long Island*)
6 *Corporation, et al. v. Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No.*)
7 *12-cv-02648; and*)
8 *Schultze Agency Services, LLC, et al. v.*)
9 *Hitachi, Ltd., et al., No. 12-cv-02649.*)
10)
11)
12)
13)
14)
15)
16)
17)
18)
19)
20)
21)
22)
23)
24)
25)
26)
27)
28)

1 TO THE HONORABLE SAMUEL CONTI, UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE:

2 On April 9, 2013, Thomson Consumer Electronics, Inc. ("Thomson Consumer") filed its
3 Motion to Intervene. In the Motion to Intervene, Thomson Consumer seeks the Court's permission to
4 intervene in the above-titled action for the limited purpose of opposing the Direct Action Plaintiffs'
5 ("Plaintiffs") Motion for Leave to File Amended Complaints (Dkt. No. 1609), which proposes to add
6 Thomson Consumer as a defendant in this action.

7 Having carefully considered the briefs and other submissions of the parties, as well as
8 oral arguments by counsel at the hearing, the Special Master recommends that the Motion to Intervene
9 should be GRANTED.

10
11 DATED: _____

12 Hon. Charles A. Legge
13 United States District Judge (Ret.)
14 Special Master

15 The Report and Recommendations are Accepted and Ordered / Denied / Modified.

16 DATED: _____

17 Hon. Samuel Conti
18 United States District Judge